

MEETING MINUTES

Planning & Zoning Commission

City Hall • 3800 Municipal Way • Hilliard, Ohio 43026
and Live-Streaming on YouTube



Thursday, December 8, 2022 | 7:00 pm

CALL TO ORDER

Vice Chairman Bevan Schneck called the Regular Meeting of Planning and Zoning Commission to order at 7:00 PM.

PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE TO THE FLAG

Mr. Pannett led the Commission and attendees in the Pledge of Allegiance.

ROLL CALL

Attendee Name:	Title:	Status:
Chairman Jay Muether	Chair	Excused
Vice Chair Bevan Schneck	Vice Chair	Present
Eric Gutknecht	Member	Excused
Chris Lewie	Member	Present
Tracey Nixon	Member	Present
Tom Pannett	Member	Present
Bill Uttley	Member	Present

Staff Members Present: Planning Director John Talentino, City Engineer Clark Rausch, Planning Manager Carson Combs, Staff Attorney Kelly Clodfelder and Assistant City Manager Dan Ralley.

Others Present: Chad Lowe representing Miller Pipeline (PZ-22-62); Cole Antle representing Westwood Collective (PZ-22-66); Hayden and Chelsea Kimes representing PZ-22-68 and other members of the public in attendance.

APPROVAL OF MEETING MINUTES – November 10, 2022

Vice Chairman Bevan Schneck asked if there were any changes or corrections to the November 10, Planning and Zoning Commission minutes. Minutes were approved by voice vote.

Status:	Accepted by Voice Vote (5-0)
Ayes:	Vice Chair Bevan Schneck, Chris Lewie, Tracey Nixon, Tom Pannett, William Uttley.

OATH TO TELL THE TRUTH

Staff Attorney Kelly Clodfelder administered the Oath to Tell the Truth.

CHANGES TO THE AGENDA

Planning Manager Carson Combs noted that a request to postpone Case PZ-22-43 to the January meeting has been made by the applicant due to an inability to attend the meeting. Mr. Lewie, seconded by Ms. Nixon, made a motion to postpone Case PZ-22-43 – Colorado Mountain Sports – 4445 Cemetery Road to the January 12, 2023, meeting.

Status:	Motion to postpone was accepted by voice vote (5-0).
Mover:	Mr. Chris Lewie
Second:	Ms. Tracey Nixon
Ayes:	Vice Chair Bevan Schneck, Chris Lewie, Tracey Nixon, Tom Pannett, William Uttley.

CASE 1: PZ-22-62 – MILLER PIPELINE – 4990-5320 SCIOTO DARBY ROAD

PARCEL NUMBERS: 050-002800, 050-003002 & 050-002343

APPLICANT: D&D Property Management LLC, 8850 Crawfordsville Road, Indianapolis, IN 46234; Don & Dale Miller, 4990 Scioto Darby Road, Hilliard, OH 43026; c/o Chad Lowe, Miller Pipeline, 5000 Scioto Darby Road, Hilliard, OH 43026.

REQUEST: Review and approval of a sign variance under the provisions of Hilliard Code Section 1129.08 to reduce the minimum setback for three 18-square-foot ground signs and two flag poles from 15 feet to 0 feet.

[Mr. Combs gave the staff report]

BACKGROUND:

The site includes three parcels located along the northern side of Scioto Darby Road. The properties at 4990-5320 are leased by Miller Pipeline and are located 130 feet southeast of Jill Lane and approximately 350 feet northwest of Reed Point Drive. The site is adjacent to the Luxair Addition subdivision to the northwest, which is zoned R-2, Low/Medium Density Residential District. The rear of the properties is bounded by the Norfolk Southern rail property. Across Scioto Darby Road from the site are homes within the Conklin Subdivision (zoned R-2) and the Nightingale Estates, which is zoned R-3, Moderate Density Residential District. Properties to the southeast of the site on the same side of the road include a range of commercial businesses that are zoned B-2, Community Business District, similar to the site. The adjacent property at 4984 Scioto Darby includes multi-tenant uses.

The applicant is requesting a variance to reduce the required setback for signs from 15 feet to zero feet for the installation of three 18-square-foot, two-post signs and two flagpoles

COMMISSION ROLE:

The Commission is to review the proposal for conformance to the provisions of Code Section 1129.08. Specifically, the Code provides for the granting of variances to the Sign Code under the review criteria as outlined by Section 1129.08(d):

- Whether the property will yield a reasonable return or whether there can be any beneficial use of the property without the variance;
- Whether the variance is substantial;
- Whether the essential character of the neighborhood would be substantially altered or whether adjoining property owners would suffer substantial detriment as a result of granting the variance;
- Whether the variance would adversely affect the delivery of governmental services;
- Whether the property owner purchased the property with knowledge of the zoning restrictions;
- Whether the property owner’s predicament feasibly can be obviated through some method other than variance; and
- Whether the spirit and intent behind the zoning requirement would be observed and substantial justice done by granting the variance.

Following approval by the Commission, the applicant is responsible for obtaining a sign permit prior to installation for each sign that conforms to the requirements and conditions set forth by the Commission.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

Staff finds that the proposed sign package is generally consistent with City Code Section 1129 as modified based on comments contained within this report. Staff finds that as amended, the proposed sign plan will

blend with the general character of the area and will not substantially impact surrounding property owners. Staff finds that the proposed signage will meet the spirit and intent of the Code as modified and based on these findings, recommends approval with the following four conditions:

- 1) That a zero setback for flag poles be approved contingent upon the applicant/property owner being responsible for any damages to and/or costs incurred to flag poles as a result of utility or infrastructure work within the public right-of-way;
- 2) That the proposal be limited to two signs that are placed a minimum of five feet from the right-of-way;
- 3) That any future increase in sign size, height or change in sign type be brought back to the Commission for additional review; and
- 4) That sign permits be obtained for each sign prior to installation.

CONSIDERATIONS:

- *Site Characteristics.* The site includes three curb cuts onto Scioto Darby Road - one for each of the three parcels. The right-of-way along Scioto Darby is 80 feet in width (± 40 feet from centerline). Signage is required by Code to be placed a minimum of 15 feet from the edge of the right-of-way (± 55 feet from centerline). The applicant has indicated visibility problems for delivery trucks and is requesting variances to the required setbacks to alleviate on-site circulation problems with deliveries.
- *Code Enforcement.* The proposed signs were originally placed within the public right-of-way without authorization or an approved sign permit. Upon notification by Code Enforcement, the applicant removed the signs and submitted a variance application for the proposed signs.
- *Flag Poles.* Upon reviewing the sign application, staff determined that the existing flag poles are also located within the public right-of-way and must be removed. The flag poles are proposed to be moved straight back toward the parking lot to be relocated just outside of the right-of-way to continue utilizing existing ground lighting without impacting the parking lot. Staff recommends that the setback reduction be permitted with the condition that the applicant waive municipal/utility company responsibility for any costs associated with relocation and/or damage incurred due to work within the right-of-way.
- *Proposed Sign Package.* The applicant is requesting a total of three sign locations that would be placed at the right-of-way line (zero-foot setback). The signs include a two-post design with a sign face that is 18 square feet in area (3' x 6'). Staff finds that given the nature of the requested variance, there is no need for the equivalent of three business identification signs and recommends that the sign proposal be limited to two signs placed a minimum of five feet from the right-of-way. Staff also recommends that limitations should be established so that any sign change that increases overall size or changes the type of sign be brought back to the Commission for additional consideration in light of the variances. There is no landscaping proposed for the signage.

[END OF REPORT | PZ-22-62]

Based on public comment, Mr. Combs entered into the record an additional condition as part of the staff recommendation:

- 5) That all lighting issues be brought into Code compliance.

Mr. Lewie inquired about landscaping for the signs; Mr. Combs explained that because they are proposing a post-design the applicant is requesting to not install landscaping. He noted that staff is also looking at modifying landscape requirements for signs in the future due to maintenance issues. Mr. Combs noted that the proposal as submitted does not include landscaping.

Mr. Pannett asked about the location of the flagpoles; Mr. Combs explained that the poles are approximately 4 to 5 feet within the right-of-way. He said that staff is requesting that the Commission approve a zero-setback for the poles so that the applicant could utilize the existing lighting. He explained that like other recent cases,

the Commission does not have the ability to approve leaving the poles within the right-of-way. He said that the options are to relocate the poles or remove them.

Chad Lowe representing Miller Pipeline explained that the signs are primarily for delivery drivers and the impact on traffic. He said that now their main concern is why the flagpoles have to be removed after years of being within the right-of-way.

Mr. Lewie reiterated to the Commission that landscaping for signs is the current requirement.

Vice Chair Schneck referred to a public comment letter and asked for clarification from staff about visual obstructions; Mr. Combs explained that visual obstructions are actually on the other side of the street and have been addressed. He said that Code Enforcement has checked sight visibility.

Mr. Uttley, seconded by Mr. Pannett, made a motion to approve the sign variance under the provisions of Hilliard Code Section 1129.08 to reduce the minimum setback for three 18-square-foot ground signs and two flag poles from 15 feet to 0 feet with the following five conditions:

- 1) That a zero setback for flag poles be approved contingent upon the applicant/property owner being responsible for any damages to and/or costs incurred to flag poles as a result of utility or infrastructure work within the public right-of-way;
- 2) That the proposal be limited to two signs that are placed a minimum of five feet from the right-of-way;
- 3) That any future increase in sign size, height or change in sign type be brought back to the Commission for additional review;
- 4) That sign permits be obtained for each sign prior to installation; and
- 5) That all lighting issues be brought into Code compliance.

Status:	Approved (5-0) with five conditions.
Mover:	Mr. Bill Uttley
Seconded:	Mr. Tom Pannett
Ayes:	Vice Chair Bevan Schneck, Chris Lewie, Tracey Nixon, Tom Pannett, William Uttley.

CASE 2: PZ-22-43 – COLORADO MOUNTAIN SPORTS – 4445 CEMETERY ROAD

PARCEL NUMBER: 050-002824

APPLICANT: Cemetery Rd Holdings LLC, c/o Eric Bahgat, 4445 Cemetery Road, Hilliard, OH 43026.

REQUEST: Review and approval of a PUD Final Development Plan modification under the provisions of the Cemetery Road Properties Located Between Leap & Lacon Roads PUD Concept Plan and Text for a two-story, 3,240-square-foot building addition on 0.44-acre.

[This case was postponed to the January 2023 meeting]

BACKGROUND:

The site consists of approximately 0.44-acre located at the southwest corner of Cemetery Road and Lacon Road and includes Lot 230 and Lot 231 of the original Easthill Acres subdivision plat. Both lots were combined within the last two years. The site has an existing 3,861-square-foot retail building, which Franklin County Auditor records indicate was constructed in 1980. To the west are commercial properties and to the south are single-family residences all zoned PUD as part of the “Cemetery Road Properties Located Between Leap & Lacon Roads” Concept Plan. To the east, across Lacon Road, are commercial properties zoned M-1, Restricted Industrial District. To the north across Cemetery Road is a church zoned B-3, Office/Institutional District, and additional commercial properties zoned B-2, Community Business District. City Council recently adopted Ordinance 22-31

(effective November 26, 2022) to rezone the northern half of the site from B-1, Neighborhood business District to PUD, Planned Unit Development District. City Council also adopted Resolution 22-R-97 on November 28, 2022, approving PUD text modifications for setbacks and other related standards that were recommended by the Commission in August 2022.

The applicant is now requesting approval of a PUD Final Development Plan modification to permit a 2-story, 3,240-square-foot addition to the existing Colorado Mountain Sports building.

COMMISSION ROLE:

The Commission is to review the proposed PUD Final Development Plan modification for conformance to the provisions of the “Cemetery Road Properties Located Between Leap & Lacon Roads” PUD Concept Plan. The Commission is also to review this final development plan modification for conformance to the PUD provisions of the Zoning Code as outlined in the PUD provisions of Chapter 1117. Specifically, the Code provides for the granting of final development plan approval under the criteria as outlined by Section 1117.06:

- Whether the proposed development is consistent with the purposes and conditions of the PUD Zoning District;
- Whether the proposal is consistent with the Hilliard Comprehensive Plan and is compatible with existing and potential uses around the property;
- Whether the layout and design is harmonious with the natural character of the surrounding area and site and employs best management practices;
- Whether the proposed project will place undue burden on public facilities and services;
- Whether the PUD will contain uses or conditions that may be injurious to the public health, safety and welfare;
- Whether the proposed development conforms to Code requirements unless specifically modified and approved in accordance with Chapter 1117;
- Whether the final development plan is generally consistent with the approved Concept Plan; and
- Whether the approval will result in a recognizable and substantial benefit to users of the project and the community, which would not otherwise be feasible under conventional zoning districts.

Following approval by the Commission, the applicant can move forward with final engineering and submit for permits to begin construction of the proposed improvements according to the requirements of the Code and conditions set forth by the Commission.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

Staff finds that the proposed PUD Final Development Plan modification, as amended in the conditions listed below, is consistent with the approved PUD Concept Plan. Staff finds that such modification is not in conflict with the general health, safety, and welfare of the public. Based on these findings, staff recommends approval of the proposed PUD Final Development Plan modification with the following eight conditions:

- 1) That an additional 10 feet of right-of-way along Cemetery Road is dedicated to the City consistent with the Hilliard Thoroughfare Plan and that parking pavement within the dedicated right-of-way be removed subject to approval of the City Engineer;
- 2) That a variance for the proposed employee parking spaces is obtained by the Board of Zoning Appeals;
- 3) That all building plans be revised to comply with applicable Building and Fire Code requirements;
- 4) That all plans be updated to comply with the City’s regulations for stormwater management to the satisfaction of the City Engineer;
- 5) That the site plan be revised to include required landscaping per Code;
- 6) That the southern drive approach be limited to 14 feet in width;

- 7) That an additional shutter and horizontal trim board be provided on all elevations of the addition that have a stucco finish, subject to staff approval; and
- 8) That a building permit is obtained prior to construction.

CONSIDERATIONS:

- The site has approximately 62 feet of frontage along Cemetery Road, and approximately 180 feet of frontage along Lacon Road. The existing building has an access point on Cemetery Road and a second on Lacon Road (both at the intersection). A third curb cut is located along Lacon Road near the southern property line and is the former access for a residence that was demolished.
- The Franklin County Recorder’s Office notes that in 2017, the City acquired a sliver of additional right-of-way at the corner of Cemetery Road and Lacon Road for street improvements associated with the intersection. The deed was transferred on December 7, 2017. Additional right-of-way along Cemetery Road consistent with the Thoroughfare Plan was not acquired in 2017 due to the timing of the public improvements.

Thoroughfare Plan

- The Thoroughfare Plan identifies Cemetery Road between Leap Road and Britton Parkway as a Major Arterial (four-lane roadway with 2 through lanes in each direction and either a center left-turn lane or separate left-turn lanes at driveways and intersections) with a minimum 100-foot-wide right-of-way. The site has 40 feet of right-of-way from centerline along its Cemetery Road frontage. **An additional 10 feet of right-of-way along Cemetery Road is needed to conform to the Thoroughfare Plan and should be provided as part of the site development. The parking space within the dedication should be removed as part of the proposed expansion.**

Comprehensive Plan

- The Comprehensive Plan recommends the site for Neighborhood Retail uses as a small-scale commercial mixed-use center intended to serve the daily needs of residents and employment centers with a mile radius. The maximum recommended tenant size is 20,000 square feet. Second or third floor uses may include retail, commercial, or residential uses. Parking shall be to the side or rear of the development, and excellent ped/bike access should be provided to all surrounding uses. These retail developments should have a distinct street presence and highly attractive and memorable architecture. Public space and landmarks such as a plaza, small green, fountain, esplanade, or even a clock tower should be included in the development to provide places for area residents to gather and socialize, and to define the character of the development.

PUD Development Text

- The approved *Cemetery Road Properties Located Between Leap and Lacon Roads* PUD text lists the following permitted uses: retail, personal services, business services, offices and banks, non-fast-food restaurants, gas stations and childcare. The proposed retail use is consistent with the text.
- The approved PUD text specifies minimum building setbacks for a commercial use fronting onto Lacon Road, and the proposed plan meets requirements:

BUILDING SETBACK	DISTANCE
Front (Cemetery Road)	50 feet
Front (Lacon Road)	20 feet
Side	10 feet
Rear	10 feet

Proposed PUD Final Development Plan

- The proposed plans show a 3,240-square-foot addition to the rear of the building. The plans show a one-way access drive along the east side of the building with egress onto Lacon Road at the south end of the

site. **Staff recommends that the southern drive approach be limited to a maximum of 14 feet in width as approved by the City Engineer.**

- The minimum number of required parking spaces is 13 based on the proposed plans. The plans provide the required number of spaces, but spaces for employees will include four double-stacked spaces and one space along the building with restricted access. **The applicant has applied to the Board of Zoning Appeals seeking a variance to approve a comprehensive parking arrangement. The application is scheduled on the December 15, 2020, Board of Zoning Appeals agenda.**
- Proposed architectural elevations show different options for architecture on the east building elevation. Option 3A is preferred and would include horizontal siding with spandrel glass windows to replace the existing stucco. The addition would include faux shutters on the second floor with a board and batten finish. **All final plans must comply with applicable building code and fire code requirements.**
- At this time information that demonstrates compliance with stormwater management regulations have not been provided and will be necessary as part of the permit approval process. **Final details should be submitted to the satisfaction of the City Engineer prior to construction activities.**

Architecture

- The PUD text for this site requires that brick, stone, or similar materials are used that compliment each structure. Materials proposed for the project include a board-and-batten treatment and horizontal wood siding. Plans include the incorporation of spandrel glass and faux shutters along Lacon Road to provide architectural variety. Option 3A is the preferred configuration of materials for the east building elevation, and smooth stucco is also proposed as an alternate material for the proposed addition. **Staff recommends that an additional shutter and trim be added to the east elevation of the addition if stucco is selected as the final material choice. If stucco is selected for the south and west elevations of the addition, then staff would recommend that the elevations be revised by adding a horizontal trim board consistent with what is shown on the proposed elevations featuring board and batten siding.**

[END OF REPORT | PZ-22-43]

As part of changes to the agenda, Mr. Lewie, seconded by Ms. Nixon, made a motion to postpone Case PZ-22-43 – Colorado Mountain Sports – 4445 Cemetery Road to the January 12, 2023, meeting.

Status:	Motion to postpone was accepted by voice vote (5-0).
Mover:	Mr. Chris Lewie
Second:	Ms. Tracey Nixon
Ayes:	Vice Chair Bevan Schneck, Chris Lewie, Tracey Nixon, Tom Pannett, William Uttley.

CASE 3: PZ-22-66 – SHOPPES BY WESTWOOD – 4055 MAIN STREET

PARCEL NUMBERS: 050-000188 & 050-000084

APPLICANT: Old Hilliard Ltd., c/o Andy Warnock, P.O. Box 1471, Hilliard, OH 43026.

REQUEST: Review & approval of a comprehensive signage plan consisting of wall signs, projecting signs, and A-frame signs for each tenant space.

[Mr. Combs gave the staff report]

BACKGROUND:

The site is 0.294-acre located on the western corner of Main Street and Norwich Street in Old Hilliard. The site is zoned OH-MD, Old Hilliard Mixed Use District, which allows for a wide range of residential and commercial uses. The one-story building is approximately 9,900 square feet in area and includes four tenant spaces with a mix of retail uses. The property also includes a plaza space along Main Street. On July 14, 2022, the Planning and Zoning Commission approved a plan for exterior awnings, lighting, and colors.

The applicant is now requesting approval of a Signage Plan for the overall site consisting of wall signs, projecting signs, and sandwich board signs for each tenant space.

COMMISSION ROLE:

The Commission is to review the proposal for conformance to the provisions of Code Section 1129.08. Specifically, the Code provides for the granting of variances to the Sign Code under the review criteria as outlined by Section 1129.08(d):

- Whether the property will yield a reasonable return or whether there can be any beneficial use of the property without the variance;
- Whether the variance is substantial;
- Whether the essential character of the neighborhood would be substantially altered or whether adjoining property owners would suffer substantial detriment as a result of granting the variance;
- Whether the variance would adversely affect the delivery of governmental services;
- Whether the property owner purchased the property with knowledge of the zoning restrictions;
- Whether the property owner's predicament feasibly can be obviated through some method other than variance; and
- Whether the spirit and intent behind the zoning requirement would be observed and substantial justice done by granting the variance.

Following approval by the Commission, the applicant is responsible for obtaining a sign permit prior to installation for each sign that conforms to the requirements and conditions set forth by the Commission.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

Staff finds that the proposal, as amended in the conditions listed below, is consistent with the provisions of the Sign Code. Based on this finding, staff recommends approval of the Signage Plan with the following 5 conditions:

- 1) That each tenant is permitted to have not more than one sandwich board (A-frame) sign with dimensions not greater than 3 feet by 5 feet with not more than four colors;
- 2) That each tenant is permitted to have not more than one projecting sign with dimensions and location as specified by the Sign Code;
- 3) That each tenant is permitted to have wall signage consistent with the provisions of the Sign Code;
- 4) That final designs for any tenant directory signs be specifically approved by the Planning and Zoning Commission; and
- 5) That a sign permit is obtained prior to the installation of each sign.

CONSIDERATIONS:

- *Retail Spaces.* 4055 Main Street includes a total of four retail spaces or suites. The building includes one tenant with access facing Main Street, an additional tenant with corner access facing the intersection of Main and Norwich Streets, and two additional tenant spaces with access onto Norwich Street.
- *Wall Signs.* Wall signage for each tenant will be consistent with the provisions of the Sign Code. The Sign Code permits a maximum of one square foot of sign area for each linear foot of building wall facing the street for each tenant space. A maximum of ½ square foot of sign area for each linear foot of building wall facing a second street is permitted.

- *Projecting Signs.* A maximum of one projecting sign per tenant space will be permitted. The Sign Code permits a maximum projection of three feet from the building and requires the sign to be double faced and not less than eight feet above the sidewalk grade.
- *Sandwich Board.* A maximum of one sandwich board (A-frame) sign not larger than 3-feet-by-5-feet for each tenant would be permitted. The Sign Code permits a maximum of one sandwich board sign per *property* in Old Hilliard with a maximum size of 4 square feet. Sandwich board signs are not permitted on the sidewalk unless the building is located immediately adjacent to the sidewalk in which case the sign may be located subject to the City Engineer’s approval.
- *Tenant Directories.* Two tenant directory wall signs, one on each of the southeast and northeast building elevations is proposed. **Details for these signs have not been provided, and staff recommends that the signs be brought back to the Planning and Zoning Commission for future review.**

[END OF REPORT | PZ-22-66]

Cole Antle, representing the Westwood Collective, indicated for the record that the applicant agrees with the conditions listed in the report. He asked for clarification regarding the use of A-frame signs and whether or not the A-frame signs would be considered as a temporary sign; Mr. Talentino clarified that a one-time sign permit is required for each A-frame and then they can be used when the business is open.

Mr. Pannett, seconded by Ms. Nixon, made a motion to approve a comprehensive signage plan consisting of wall signs, projecting signs, and A-frame signs for each tenant space with the following five conditions:

- 1) That each tenant is permitted to have not more than one sandwich board (A-frame) sign with dimensions not greater than 3 feet by 5 feet with not more than four colors;
- 2) That each tenant is permitted to have not more than one projecting sign with dimensions and location as specified by the Sign Code;
- 3) That each tenant is permitted to have wall signage consistent with the provisions of the Sign Code;
- 4) That final designs for any tenant directory signs be specifically approved by the Planning and Zoning Commission; and
- 5) That a sign permit is obtained prior to the installation of each sign.

Status:	Approved (5-0) with five conditions.
Mover:	Mr. Tom Pannett
Second:	Ms. Tracey Nixon
Ayes:	Vice Chair Bevan Schneck, Chris Lewie, Tracey Nixon, Tom Pannett, William Uttley.

CASE 4: PZ-22-68 – KIMES RESIDENCE – 5190 NORWICH STREET

PARCEL NUMBERS: 050-000321 & 050-000293

APPLICANT: Hayden & Chelsea Kimes, 5190 Norwich Street, Hilliard, OH 43026.

REQUEST: Review & approval of an Old Hilliard District Plan under the provisions of Hilliard Code Chapter 1115 to permit a 3,970-square-foot building addition.

[Mr. Combs gave the staff report]

BACKGROUND:

The site consists of two parcels totaling 0.54 acre located on the northeast side of Norwich Street approximately 200 feet southeast of Hamilton Road. The Franklin County Auditor records indicate the 2,210-square-foot house was constructed in 1900. The site also includes a ±980-square-foot detached garage. The applicant is now requesting approval of an Old Hilliard District Plan to permit an addition to the existing dwelling.

COMMISSION ROLE:

The Commission is to review the Old Hilliard District Plan proposal for conformance to the general design criteria as specified in Code Section 1115.05 to determine whether the proposed Old Hilliard District Plan achieves the following criteria:

- Whether the project conforms to neighborhood development goals and the recommendations of the Comprehensive Plan.
- Whether the project is complementary to the historic character of the District.
- Whether the project harmoniously relates to and enhances adjacent structures and public spaces with respect to scale, building materials, setbacks and similar design elements.
- Whether the proposal accommodates and promotes pedestrian activity through wide sidewalks, linkages to surrounding uses and public spaces and minimal conflicts with vehicular access.
- Whether the project contributes to the area's sense of place, reinforce Old Hilliard's unique character and enhance the people-oriented setting.
- Whether the proposal places special emphasis on creating people-oriented facades along Main and Norwich Streets and are facades in scale with pedestrian activity and movement with entrances that are well-defined and inviting.
- Whether the proposed plan addresses specific design requirements for architecture, building materials, color, roof forms, windows, mechanicals, awnings, landscaping, screening, parking, utilities, maintenance and signage as provided for in Section 1115.05.

Following approval by the Commission, the applicant may submit for permits to begin construction of the proposed improvements according to the requirements of the Code and conditions set forth by the Commission.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

Staff finds that the proposal is consistent with the provisions of the Zoning Code and furthers the goals of the Hilliard Comprehensive Plan and generally meet the criteria for an Old Hilliard District Plan. Based on these findings, staff recommends approval of the proposal with the following four conditions:

- 1) That a variance to reduce the minimum side yard from 5 feet to 3.5 feet is obtained from the Board of Zoning Appeals;
- 2) That the garage is located not less than 50 feet from the Norwich Street right-of-way line;
- 3) That exterior materials and colors are consistent with those proposed, subject to staff approval; and
- 4) That a building permit is obtained prior to construction.

CONSIDERATIONS:

- The site is zoned OH-RD, Old Hilliard Residential District. Single-family residence is a permitted use in this zoning district. The Hilliard Comprehensive Plan recommends the site for medium-density residential housing. New infill development should follow the residential and architectural pattern that exists. Parking should be located as to not dominate the front of the structure and side-loaded or detached garages are preferred. Front porches and patios are strongly encouraged in this area.
- According to Hilliard Code Section 1115.05, the architectural design of buildings must create and enhance the community image. Variations in façade elements shall be incorporated into all sides of the principal building to minimize the perceived mass and scale. The width of a principal building façade

along a public street shall be a minimum of 60 percent of the lot width. Colors shall be neutral and natural tones with low reflectivity. Accent and trim colors must complement the effect of the primary building color. Bold, brash, intense, bright, fluorescent, black or metallic accent colors are prohibited, unless approved by the Planning and Zoning Commission for very limited application. All exterior colors should be subdued, with strong colors such as reds, blues, and golds, etc., should only be applied to trim and accent being avoided. Roof colors shall be muted and compatible with the dominant building color. Sloped roofs shall be a minimum 6/12 pitch and a maximum 12/12 pitch.

- Development standards in the OH-RD zoning district include a front setback of 0 to 25 feet, minimum 5-foot side yard on one side, minimum 12-foot total side yards, minimum 25-foot rear yard, maximum 35-foot building height, and minimum 1,300-square-foot floor area.
- The proposal includes the demolition of the rear half of the existing house and the existing detached garage. The proposed addition consists of a new front porch, new first and second floors at the rear of the house, and a 3-car garage on the southeast side of the house. With the proposed addition, setbacks will be 25.5 feet from the Norwich Street right-of-way line, 26.8 feet from the northwest property line, 3.5 feet from the southeast property line, and approximately 158 feet from the rear property line. It should be noted that the garage will be set back approximately 58 feet from the Norwich Street right-of-way line to not dominate the front of the house consistent with the recommendations in the Comprehensive Plan. **The applicant has applied to the Board of Zoning Appeals seeking a variance to reduce the required side yard from 5 feet to 3.5 feet for the proposed addition. The application is scheduled on the December 15, 2020, Board of Zoning Appeals agenda.**
- The proposed two-story building addition includes 1,163 square feet on the first floor, 1,826 square feet on the second floor, and, on the southeast side of the house, a 981-square-foot attached garage and a new chimney. A new front porch is proposed along the entire front of the house and along a portion of the northwest side and will feature a standing seam metal roof. Exterior materials for the proposed addition include horizontal composite board siding (Hardie Plank 8-inch exposure – Sherwin Williams SW 7008 “Alabaster”) in combination with composite board shingle siding (Hardie Shingle Siding SW 7008 “Alabaster”), standing seam metal roofing (Galvanized color) on the front porch and a portion of the rear elevation, and asphalt shingles (CertainTeed Landmark Pro “Moire Black”). The chimney is shown with cultured stone (Dutch Quality “Kentucky Limestone” or “Tuscan Ridge”). The proposed roof pitch is 10/12, except on the front porch which ranges from 3/12 to 4.5/12. Proposed windows are white double-hung 2-over-2 panels consistent with those on the existing dwelling. The front door and side porch door are red (Sherwin Williams SW 7587 “Antique Red”), and all other exterior doors including the garage door are white (Sherwin Williams SW 7008 “Alabaster”). Shutters are blue (Sherwin Williams SW 6244 “Naval Blue”) and gutters and downspouts are white. Exterior trim and soffits will match the siding color.

[END OF REPORT | PZ-22-68]

Mr. Combs clarified that the existing detached garage located on the property line would be removed and the proposed attached garage would actually increase the setback.

Hayden and Chelsea Kimes addressed the Commission and noted that they agree with the conditions in the staff report. They clarified for Mr. Uttley that the existing garage would be torn down as part of the proposal.

Mr. Lewie asked for confirmation that the selected colors are compatible with the historic paint palette; the Kimes confirmed that the colors are similar to the existing condition and will include a cream/light tan exterior with dark blue detailing. They noted that the only real change is the proposed red door color.

Mr. Uttley commented for the record that the proposed architecture is very appealing.

Ms. Nixon, seconded by Mr. Lewie, made a motion to approve an Old Hilliard District Plan under the provisions of Hilliard Code Chapter 1115 to permit a 3,970-square-foot building addition with the following four conditions:

- 1) That a variance to reduce the minimum side yard from 5 feet to 3.5 feet is obtained from the Board of Zoning Appeals;
- 2) That the garage is located not less than 50 feet from the Norwich Street right-of-way line;
- 3) That exterior materials and colors are consistent with those proposed, subject to staff approval; and
- 4) That a building permit is obtained prior to construction.

Status:	Approved (5-0) with four conditions.
Mover:	Ms. Tracey Nixon
Seconded:	Mr. Chris Lewie
Ayes:	Vice Chair Bevan Schneck, Chris Lewie, Tracey Nixon, Tom Pannett, William Uttley

DISCUSSION ITEMS / COMMITTEE COMMUNICATIONS

Vice Chair Schneck thanked Mr. Lewie for bringing cookies to the meeting.

Mr. Lewie inquired about the status of the Comprehensive Plan; Mr. Talentino noted that a final draft should be provided to the Commission before February. He said that the Commission will have a month to review prior to being formally heard as part of business. He said that staff will provide a presentation at that time. Mr. Talentino also agreed with Mr. Pannett that staff can provide hard copies to the Commission members for review.

Mr. Uttley noted that the Arts Commission meeting was cancelled due to illness.

Ms. Nixon informed the Commission that the recreation center will also include a private partnership. She inquired about Commission compensation since she missed the prior meeting; Vice Chair Schneck noted that the new arrangement had been approved in the budget.

ADJOURNMENT – 7:30 PM

With no additional business, Mr. Uttley (seconded by Mr. Lewie) motioned to adjourn at 7:30 p.m.

CERTIFICATION:



Carson Combs, Planning Manager
January 13, 2023

[END OF MINUTES | December 8, 2022]